

GENDERED PERSPECTIVES IN TRANSLATION: A CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF MANTO'S 'THANDA GOSHT' IN ENGLISH

Faria Shaheen

Associate Lecturer, Centre for Languages and Translation Studies, University of Gujrat, Pakistan.

Email: faria.shaheen@uog.edu.pk

Dr. Muhammad Javed Iqbal (Corresponding Author)

Lecturer, Centre for Languages and Translation Studies, University of Gujrat, Pakistan.

Email: dr.javediqbal188@gmail.com

Rahat Ayub

MPhil Scholar, Centre for Languages and Translation Studies, University of Gujrat, Pakistan.

Email: rahatmughal776@gmail.com

Abstract

This study examines the impact of translator gender on the translation process, exploring how gender influences the meaning and interpretation of translated texts. Focusing on Sa'adat Hassan Manto's short story "Thanda Gosht," this research compares two translations: one by Mustansar Dalvi, an Indian translator, and another by C. Christine Fair, an American translator. The study reveals that translators' gender can significantly influence the translation outcome, leading to potential misinterpretations and altered meanings. Employing a Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) approach combined with a constructivist paradigm, this research investigates the intersection of translators' gender, subjectivity, and translation strategies, finding that the gender of the translator significantly affects the translation outcome. This study emphasises the importance of considering translators' gender in the process of translation and highlights the need for translators to be aware of their subjective biases and cultural backgrounds.

Keywords: Translation, Translator's Gender, Critical Discourse Analysis, Feminist Translation.

Introduction

Translation encompasses a complex interplay of linguistic, ideological, and cultural factors. The process involves subjective interpretation, which can alter the original meaning of the source text. Ideally, translations should strive for neutrality and objectivity. However, the translator's identity, particularly their gender, significantly influences the perception of the target text.

The translation process extends beyond linguistic transformation, incorporating cultural, social, and personal elements that shape text interpretation and representation. As an intermediary, the translator brings distinct perspectives and biases that impact the final product. Scholarly attention has focused on the translator's gender and its effect on the translation process and resulting text (Baker, 2006).

This study investigates the influence of translator gender by comparing two translations of Sa'adat Hassan Manto's short story "Thanda Gosht." The translations, produced by Mustansar Dalvi and C. Christine Fair, reflect unique socio-cultural and gendered backgrounds. Dalvi's translation represents a South Asian cultural perspective, while Fair's translation brings a perspective shaped by a society with fewer gender stereotypes and distinct cultural norms (Venuti, 1995).

The present research employs a Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) approach, complemented by a

constructivist paradigm, to examine how translator subjectivity and gender influence the meaning-making process and impact readers' perceptions. This perspective is grounded in theories that highlight the role of translator subjectivity in shaping cultural ideologies and narratives (Hatim & Mason, 1990). The significance of this perspective lies in its recognition of translation as an act of cultural power, capable of influencing readers' perceptions of social norms, gender roles, and underlying values (Baker & Maier, 2011).

This study reveals that the translator's gender can mediate the translation process, either overtly or subtly, resulting in variations that influence the interpretation and understanding of the source text (Simon, 2017). The findings of this study provide insight into how gender inflects the translation process, yielding interpretations that reflect internalised beliefs and broader societal perceptions. These findings have significant implications for the consumption and understanding of translated literature, suggesting that a translator's identity and beliefs shape a text's reception and potential influence on readers (Pym, 2010). This research aims to contribute to translation studies by highlighting the inherent subjectivity of translation and the role of gender in shaping the transmission of cultural and literary meanings.

The researcher was fascinated by the work of von Flotow (1997), "Translation and Gender", which demonstrates that the gender of the translator significantly influences the translation process and product. This study's findings, highlighting the impact of the translator's gender on the representation of gender roles and ideologies, resonated with the researcher's own inquiry.

Contextual Background of the Study

Sa'adat Hassan Manto's short story "*Thanda Gosht*" was a seminal work of 20th-century Indian literature, written during the tumultuous period of the Indian partition (Manto, 1950). The story revolved around the themes of violence, identity, and cultural dislocation, offering a powerful critique of the social and cultural norms of the time (Jalal & Jalal, 2012).

The historical and cultural context in which the story was written was crucial to understanding its themes and motifs (Baker, 2006). The Indian subcontinent underwent a period of significant upheaval, marked by communal violence, displacement, and social change (Pandey, 2001). Manto's work reflected the anxieties and uncertainties of this era, offering a powerful exploration of the human condition (Tymoczko, 2006).

The translation of literary works like "*Thanda Gosht*" was a complex process, requiring a deep understanding of the cultural and historical context in which the work was written (Venuti, 1995). Translators played a significant role in mediating cultural meanings and facilitating cross-cultural understanding (Hatim & Mason, 1990).

This study examined the role of the translator's gender in shaping the translation process and the resulting text. Through a comparative analysis of the translations of "*Thanda Gosht*" by two translators with different gender identities and cultural backgrounds, this study aimed to contribute to our understanding of the intersections between translation, gender, and cultural studies.

Statement of the Problem

The translation of literary texts involves complex linguistic, cultural, and subjective interpretations, with the translator's gender being a significant factor. In translating South Asian literature into English, the influence of the translator's gender on the translation process remains a knowledge gap. The translation of Sa'adat Hassan Manto's "*Thanda Gosht*" by translators with different gender backgrounds raises important questions about the role of gender in shaping the translation process and outcome. This study aims to address this gap, examining how the translator's gender influences the translation of Manto's "*Thanda Gosht*" and the translational

strategies employed in its English translations.

Gender and Translation

The role of gender in translation is a complex and multifaceted issue, with far-reaching implications for the interpretation and representation of cultural meanings (Simon, 2017). Research has shown that translators' gender identities can shape their linguistic choices, influencing the way they convey cultural norms, values, and ideologies (Baker, 2006). For instance, female translators may be more likely to use linguistic strategies that emphasise emotional tone and empathy, whereas male translators may favour more formal and objective language (Tymoczko, 2006). The cultural and social contexts in which translators operate also impact their gendered approaches to translation, highlighting the need for a subtle understanding of the relationships between gender, culture, and translation (Venuti, 1995).

Selected Texts

1. Source Text in Urdu

"Thanda Gosht" (Cold Meat) is a renowned Urdu short story written by Sa'adat Hassan Manto, a prominent Pakistani writer and playwright. Born on May 11, 1912, in Ludhiana, British India, Manto was known for his bold and provocative writings on social and cultural issues. *"Thanda Gosht"* is one of Manto's most celebrated works, exploring themes of violence, identity, and cultural dislocation during the Indian partition (Manto, 1940).

2. Selected Translated Texts in English

i. Mustansar Dalvi (Indian Male Translator)

Mustansar Dalvi is an Indian male translator and scholar with a South Asian cultural background. Born and raised in Mumbai, India, Dalvi holds a Master's degree in English Literature from the University of Mumbai. His Indian upbringing and education provide a unique perspective on the cultural nuances of Manto's works. With over a decade of translation experience, Dalvi has worked on numerous literary projects, including the translation of Manto's short stories (Dalvi, 2013).

ii. C. Christine Fair (American Female Translator)

C. Christine Fair is an American female translator and scholar specialising in South Asian languages and cultures. Born and raised in the United States, Fair holds a PhD in South Asian Languages and Cultures from the University of Chicago. Her American background and expertise in South Asian cultures bring a distinct perspective to the translation of Manto's works. With extensive experience in translating Urdu and Hindi texts, Fair offers a fresh perspective on Manto's classic short story (Fair, 2018).

Rationale for the Study

Sa'adat Hassan Manto's Urdu short story *"Thanda Gosht"* (Manto, 1940) has been translated into English, but these translations vary due to linguistic expertise, personal perspectives and cultural backgrounds (Bassnett, 2002). Research shows that gender differences significantly impact translation, with male and female translators conveying different meanings (Simon, 1996). This study investigates the role of gender in shaping translation, particularly its influence on meaning-making. An examination of different translations of *"Thanda Gosht"* revealed substantial differences in cultural and linguistic representations, prompting questions about how gender differences contribute to these variations.

Objectives

- To analyse the influence of the translator's gender on the translation of Manto's "*Thanda Gosht*".
- To examine the translational strategies, methods, and procedures employed by translators in the English translations of Manto's "*Thanda Gosht*".

Research Questions

RQ1: How does the translator's gender influence the translation of Manto's "*Thanda Gosht*"?

RQ2: What are the translational strategies, methods, and procedures applied by the translators in the English translations of Manto's "*Thanda Gosht*"?

Significance of the Study

This study is significant as it contributes to a deeper understanding of the complex dynamics of translation and its implications on the representation of gender and power relations (Bassnett & Lefevere, 1990). Analysing the translational strategies employed in two English language translations of "*Thanda Gosht*" by male and female translators sheds light on how cultural and ideological biases, particularly those related to gender, are negotiated and represented in translation (Venuti, 1995). Predominantly, the two translations yield unique results, highlighting the significance of the translator's gender in shaping the translated text. The findings of this study have implications for translation theory and practice, particularly in the context of postcolonial literature (Niranjana, 1992), and underscore the need for a more nuanced understanding of the role of translation in shaping cultural narratives.

Literature Review

Translation:

Translation is a complex process that transcends linguistic equivalence, involving intricate ideological and cultural negotiations (Bassnett & Lefevere, 1990). The translator's identity, encompassing personal beliefs, cultural background, and gender, significantly influences this process (Venuti, 1995). The translator's gender has emerged as a crucial variable impacting translation outcomes and processes. This review aims to explore the impact of the translator's gender on the translation process, identifying gaps in understanding the subjectivity of translators based on their gender. A comparative analysis of two translations of Sa'adat Hassan Manto's "*Thanda Gosht*" - one by a male translator with a South Asian background and the other by a female translator with an American feminist background - facilitates this investigation.

The Impact of Translator Gender on Translation

The translator's gender has long been a subject of interest, with researchers highlighting how the translator's gender influences the translation process, ultimately affecting representation, narrative voice, and ideological framing (Baker, 2006; Venuti, 1995). Venuti (1995) introduced the concept of translator invisibility, suggesting that translators either maintain fidelity to the source text or adapt it to align with their own gender and cultural biases. This perspective emphasises that translation is never an objective process, but instead one mediated by the translator's experiences and subjectivity (Baker, 2006; Venuti, 1995).

Gender and Translation

Research has shown that gender plays a significant role in shaping translation outcomes, with numerous studies analysing the translations of a single source text by two different translators. For instance, Santaemilia (2005) compared the translations of Virginia Woolf's "*A Room of One's Own*" by two Spanish translators, one male and one female, revealing significant differences in the translation of gender-related terms and concepts. Similarly, Castro (2009) analysed the

translations of Clarice Lispector's "The Hour of the Star" by two English translators, one male and one female, finding that the female translator's version was more nuanced and sensitive to the original text's feminist themes. Other studies have also investigated the impact of gender on translation, including Flotow (2011), Tahir-Gürçağlar (2013), Al-Sharif (2015), Wang (2017), Abdallah (2018), and Khorashadi (2020), all of which highlight the importance of considering the translator's gender in translation research.

Baker (2006) elaborated on the influence of translators' social identities, particularly their gender, on lexical choices and interpretation. This perspective aligns with the constructivist paradigm, which postulates that meaning and knowledge are constructed through individuals' subjective experiences and interactions (Crotty, 1998). Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) provides a valuable framework for understanding how ideology, power, and gender intersect in the translation process (Fairclough, 1995).

Numerous studies have employed the constructivist paradigm and CDA to investigate the impact of gender on translation. For instance, Flotow (2011) used CDA to analyse the translations of French feminist texts by male and female translators, revealing significant differences in the representation of gender roles and relationships. Similarly, Tahir-Gürçağlar (2013) employed the constructivist paradigm to examine the translations of Turkish literary texts by male and female translators, finding that the translators' gender influenced their lexical choices and interpretive decisions.

Other studies have also utilised CDA and the constructivist paradigm to explore the intersection of gender and translation. These include the works of Castro (2009), who analyzed the translations of Clarice Lispector's "The Hour of the Star" by male and female translators; Wang (2017), who examined the translations of Chinese literary texts by male and female translators; and Abdallah (2018), who investigated the translations of French literary texts by male and female translators. These studies demonstrate the significance of considering the translator's gender in translation research and highlight the value of using CDA and the constructivist paradigm to analyse the complex relationships between gender, power, and ideology in translation.

Research Gap

Although there is a significant body of literature exploring the influence of gender on translation, few studies have directly compared male and female translations or analysed translations across cultures within a single comparative framework (Simon, 2017; Tymoczko, 2006). Existing studies often examine gender as a solitary variable through case studies focused on a single translator's work (Baker, 2006; Pym, 2010). This gap in the literature overlooks how gendered subjectivity results in variations in meaning and interpretation of the exact source text when translated by individuals from diverse cultural backgrounds and genders, leading to gendered constructed perspectives and ideas (Baker & Maier, 2011; Venuti, 1995).

Research Methodology

This qualitative research study investigates the impact of gender on the translation process through a comparative analysis of two translations of Sa'adat Hassan Manto's short story "*Thanda Gosht*" (Manto, 1940). The study employs a qualitative approach, combining the Constructivist Paradigm (Piaget, 1976; Vygotsky, 1978) with Fairclough's three-dimensional model of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) (Fairclough, 1995). This integrated methodology facilitates an in-depth examination of how the cultural and gendered backgrounds of translators influence their translation choices, ultimately affecting the interpretation and meaning of the translated text (Baker, 2006; Simon, 1996).

The framework of pairing of the CDA and the Constructivist Paradigm is going to explore The integrated framework of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) and Constructivist Paradigm explored the role of translational strategies, methodologies, and approaches in shaping the translator's gendered perspectives during the translation process. Specifically, this study scrutinised the techniques used to represent characters and narratives, exposing the underlying power dynamics and ideologies that influenced the translation of Sa'adat Hassan Manto's "*Thanda Gosht*" (Fairclough, 1995; Piaget, 1976; Vygotsky, 1978).

Data Collection

The present research is based on a comparative analysis of two published translations of Sa'adat Hassan Manto's short story "*Thanda Gosht*." The data consists of:

Source Text

Manto, S. H. (1951). *Thanda Gosht* (pp. 164-171).

Translated Texts

1. Translated Text 1: Dalvi, M. (Translator) (1997).

2. Translated Text 2: Fair, C. C. (Translator) (2009).

These two translations were selected for analysis to examine the translational strategies and methodologies employed by the translators, and to identify the underlying power dynamics and ideologies that shape their translations.

Abbreviations

Source Text (ST) and Target Text (TT)

ST stands for Source Text, which refers to the original text being translated.

TT stands for Target Text, which refers to the translated text.

Theoretical Framework

This study employs a research framework that combines the Constructivist Paradigm, Feminist Translation Theory by Sherry Simon (1996) and the three-dimensional model of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) by Fairclough (1995). This integrated approach facilitates an in-depth understanding of how the translator's subjectivity, influenced by sociocultural context and gender, mediates the translation process and impacts the interpretation and outcome of the translated text.

Constructivist Paradigm

The Constructivist Paradigm, based on the work of Jean Piaget (1976) and further developed by social constructivists like Lev Vygotsky (1978), posits that individuals construct knowledge through experiences and social interactions (Piaget, 1976; Vygotsky, 1978). This paradigm suggests that reality is mediated by the context of the observer's beliefs and personal experiences, making it subjective (Crotty, 1998). The Constructivist approach aligns with translation studies, as it acknowledges that translators bring their cultural backgrounds, beliefs, and lived experiences to the translated text (Nord, 2005).

Feminist Theory and Translation

Sherry Simon's feminist theory proposes that translation is a politically embedded phenomenon that can empower marginalised groups and subvert traditional hierarchies (Simon, 1996). Her feminist ideology emphasises how translators can challenge patriarchy by foregrounding gender identities and enhancing silent perspectives (Simon, 1996). By integrating feminist theories into the translation process, translators engage in a deliberative activity of cultural negotiation, where identity and power dynamics are re-imagined (Flotow, 1997).

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA)

Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is an interdisciplinary method that investigates the functions

of discourse in the form of social practices and how these practices shape ideologies and social structures (Fairclough, 1995). CDA analyses how language reproduces power relations and constructs meaning, making it a suitable approach to examine how gendered subjectivity impacts translation (Fairclough, 1995; Wodak, 2001). In translation studies, CDA can explore how translators' choices, influenced by their cultural and gendered perspectives, contribute to the construction of meaning and the perpetuation of ideological stances (Baker, 2006).

Integration of Theories and Framework

The integration of the Constructivist Paradigm (Piaget, 1976; Vygotsky, 1978), Feminist Translation Theory and Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) (Fairclough, 1995) provides a comprehensive framework to analyse the impact of the translator's gender on the translated text. CDA offers tools to analyse lexical choices and linguistic features, revealing how ideological representations and power dynamics are encoded (Fairclough, 1995; Wodak, 2001). Combined with CDA, the Constructivist Paradigm facilitates an understanding of how linguistic features are perceived by the translator's subjective context, including their gender, which influences translation choices and their perception (Crotty, 1998).

Application of the Research Framework

This research framework is applied to the analysis of two translations of Sa'ad a Hassan Manto's short story "Thanda Gosat" (Manto, 1940): one by C. Christine Fair (Fair, 2008) and the other by Mustansar Dalvi (Dalvi, 2013). The study examines the cultural ideologies and gendered norms visible through the text of both translators.

Data Analysis

A Comparative Study of Translations

This analysis examines the translations of Sa'adat Hassan Manto's short story "Thanda Gosht" by two translators, one male and one female. The source text revolves around two characters, Esher Singh and Kalwant Kaur, and their complex relationship. Notably, the male character, Esher Singh, struggles with psychological trauma, rendering him unable to fulfil his sexual duties, following his molestation of a young girl's dead body during the partition riots in India.

This study compares the translations of the two translators to investigate how the translators' genders influence the representation of characters. Specifically, it examines how the male translator, hailing from a South Asian context and part of a patriarchal society, objectifies the female character, Kalwant Kaur, in his translation. The analysis aims to shed light on the impact of the translators' gender and cultural background on the translation process and the resulting representation of characters.

Extract 1

Source Text (ST)	Target Text 1 (TT1)	Target Text 2 (TT2)
کلونت کو روکنا آسن پرندہ آیا اور وہ دونوں ناگہمیں بنگ سے نیچے لٹکا کر ہلانے لگی	Kulwant Kaur, irritated with her seat, stretched out and started to swing her legs from the edge of the bed.	Kulwant Kaur felt uncomfortable. She uncrossed her legs, dangled them over the side of the bed and began swinging them to and fro.

TT1: The male translator's use of the active voice achieves formal equivalence in the translated version. However, the choice of the word "irritated" reveals a subtle selection of stereotypes typically

associated with women, portraying them as overly emotional and prone to irritation without justification (Fairclough, 1995). This word selection creates an impression that Kalwant lacks confidence in her emotional state, leading to emotional fluctuations. The emotional tone is intensified by the use of “irritated”, conveying a sense of active dissatisfaction. The focus on external emotional expression, emphasised by the word “irritated”, may be perceived as a masculine trait, characterised by outward or visible emotional displays.

The lexical choices made by the translator generate a gendered image. In this case, the selection of the stereotypical word “irritated” by the male translator showcases his internalised beliefs rooted in his patriarchal background (Baker, 2006). From a grammatical perspective, the sentence structure remains faithful to the source text, employing the active voice with no significant variations. Certain stereotypes related to women are unconsciously internalised by both genders, perpetuating the notion that women are inherently emotional and unstable (Crotty, 1998). The translator, Mustansar Dalvi, hailing from South Asia, exemplifies this phenomenon through his lexical choice of “irritated”, which reinforces the patriarchal notion of women’s emotional instability. This highlights the emotional instability attributed to the female character, Kalwant, underscoring the significance of translator bias in shaping the narrative.

TT2: The construction of the sentence in the active voice demonstrates formal equivalence with the source text. C. Christine Fair’s translation presents a strong, dominating, and decisive female character, Kalwant Kaur. The use of the word “uncomfortable” effectively conveys her emotional state and decision to change her position. This lexical choice softens and neutralises the emotional tone, depicting Kalwant’s reflective and stable state of mind (Baker, 2006). The female translator’s vocabulary selection reveals her attempt to subvert societal stereotypes, neutralising the tone to showcase Kalwant’s composed and decisive personality. The use of softening and attenuating techniques emphasises Kalwant’s emotional stability and calmness, highlighting her agency and self-awareness.

C. Christine Fair’s representation of Kalwant is that of a soft, mild, yet dominant character who is in control of herself and her body. This portrayal challenges the traditional stereotypes of women as emotional and unstable, instead presenting a strong and decisive female character (Fairclough, 1995). In contrast, the male translator focuses on physical and external actions, perpetuating stereotypical masculine representations of women. His translation employs assertive, direct, and active tones, portraying Kalwant as emotionally unstable and reactive. Conversely, C. Christine Fair emphasises Kalwant’s emotional strength, calmness, and decisiveness.

The lexical choices in both translations demonstrate how gender influences translation techniques and the portrayal of female characters (Flotow, 2011). The female translator’s unconscious presence is evident in her text, as reflected in her adjective choices. This highlights the significance of considering the translator’s gender in shaping the narrative.

Extract 2

Source Text (ST)	Target Text 1 (TT1)	Target Text 2 (TT2)
<p>گھونٹ کور بھرے بھرے ہاتھ پیروں والی عورت تھی چوڑے چپکے کولہے، تھل تھل کرنے والے گوشت سے بھرپور کچھ زیادہ ہی اوپر کواٹھا ہوا سینہ</p>	<p>Kulwant Kaur was a full-bodied woman with wide, inviting, fleshed-out hips and breasts higher than they should be.</p>	<p>Kulwant Kaur had a sturdy build with a broad and ample ass. Her chest was conspicuous because of her excessive bosom, which brimmed with flaccid flesh.</p>

TT1: Mustansar Dalvi’s lexical choices, specifically “full-bodied woman” and “wide, inviting hips and breasts,” demonstrate the sexualization and objectification of Kalinda Kaur in the sentence. This translation decision perpetuates a patriarchal mentality, reinforcing the notion that women are objects of sexual attraction and utility (Kimmel, 2000). In contrast, the source text by Manto employs negative connotations to describe Kalinda’s physique, whereas Dalvi’s translation introduces sexualizing connotations, thereby objectifying her body (Lakoff, 1975).

The male translator’s use of direct translation methods maintains the original sentence’s essence without modification. However, this approach also underscores the translator’s unconscious bias, reflecting a societal attitude that views women as objects of desire (Baker, 2006). This translation choice not only distorts the original text’s intent but also reinforces harmful gender stereotypes, highlighting the need for critical evaluation of translation decisions and their potential impact on societal attitudes.

TT2: C. Christine Fair’s translation choices, including “ample ass”, “excessive bosom”, and “flaccid flesh”, convey negative body-shaming connotations that objectify the character described in the sentence. Upon closer examination, it becomes apparent that the translator has opted for a literal translation, closely mirroring the source text’s description of the character (Bassnett, 2014). The female translator’s use of oblique translation methods enables her to attain equivalence in meaning, ensuring a faithful translation of the source text.

In contrast, the male translator’s approach perpetuates the notion that women are primarily objects of sexual appeal, valued for their physical beauty and attractiveness (Kimmel, 2000). His translation emphasises the character’s physical attributes, reinforcing the idea that women’s bodies are subject to male gaze and scrutiny. Conversely, C. Christine Fair’s translation avoids explicit references to sexuality, instead focusing on a more nuanced portrayal of Kalwant Kaur’s character, as per the source text (Flotow, 2011).

These two translations of the same character, Kalwant Kaur, present distinct representations of her body, reflecting the translators’ subjectivity and the influence of their gender on their translation choices (Simon, 1996).

Extract 3

Source Text (ST)	Target Text 1 (TT1)	Target Text 2 (TT2)
<p>ایشہ سنگھ گو سر نہارے اک کونے میں چپ چاپ کھڑا تھا۔ سر پر اس کے کس کر بندھی ہوئی پگڑی ڈھیل ہو رہی تھی۔ اس کے ہاتھ جو کرپان تھامے ہوئے تھے، تھوڑے تھوڑے لرزاں تھے، مگر اس کے قد و قامت اور غدوخال سے پتا چلتا تھا کہ وہ کلونت کور جیسی عورت کے لیے موزوں مرد ہے</p>	<p>By his physique and by the way he carried himself, it is evident to anyone that Ishhar Singh was the right male for Kulwant Kaur. For now, he hung his head in his corner, not making a sound. On his brow, another tightly wound turban was slowly unravelling. The hand that once held fast onto the kirpan now began to tremble.</p>	<p>Ishar Singh, with his head bowed, remained standing silently in a corner. His tightly bound turban had loosened. The hand which was clutching a kirpan trembled ever so slightly. Despite his rattled state, it was obvious from his height, stature and facial features that he was a most suitable lover for a woman like Kulwant Kaur.</p>

TT1: The male translator's word choices emphasise strength and physicality, traits typically associated with masculinity. Phrases like "physique" and "the right male" highlight Ishar Singh's suitability for Kulwant Kaur primarily through his physical attributes (Kimmel, 2000). Despite the source text's description of Ishar Singh's low emotional state, the male translator focuses on his masculine traits, using phrases like "for now" to downplay his vulnerability and emphasising his "physique" and "carrying himself" (Baker, 2006). The translator's assertion and word choice deliberately portray Ishar Singh as a strong personality, slightly acknowledging his emotional vulnerability by mentioning "the hand that once held fast" and "now began to tremble" (Lakoff, 1975).

The defining qualities used by the translator are more masculine, culturally inclined to emphasise strong masculinity. The phrase "right male for Kalwant Kaur" is translated within the context of a female's internalised beliefs about a partner in her culture, regarding authority, composure, and physical strength, all associated with masculinity (Abdallah, 2018). The translator minimises Ishar Singh's vulnerability, focusing on his suitability and physique, expected of a male in a South Asian society where masculinity is linked to being composed and emotionally resilient (Tahir-Gürçağlar, 2013).

The societal views of the male translator are visible in his translation, reinforcing traditional gender roles for the male character. This highlights the significance of considering the translator's gender and cultural background in shaping the narrative (Flotow, 2011).

TT2: The female translator employs a formal equivalence technique, translating the sentence literally and borrowing the word "kirpan" from the source text. This approach demonstrates a faithful translation, maintaining the same sentence structure as the source text. The translator's word choices, such as "the hand that once held fast onto the Kirpan now began to tremble," effectively convey Eshar Singh's emotional vulnerability (Baker, 2006). C. Christine Fair's translation focuses on Eshar Singh's present emotional state, using phrases like "suitable lover"

to emphasise emotional compatibility over physical attributes (Flotow, 2011). This approach contrasts with the traditional South Asian emphasis on physical strength and masculinity.

The female translator's focus on emotional compatibility and vulnerability reflects a more nuanced understanding of relationships, one that prioritises emotional connection over physical dominance (Kimmel, 2000). The translation highlights Eshar Singh's inner conflict, presenting him as a multidimensional character whose emotional state complicates his strong appearance (Lakoff, 1975). This portrayal challenges traditional notions of masculinity, instead emphasising the importance of emotional depth and vulnerability in relationships.

The gendered subjectivity of the translator is evident in the differing approaches to Eshar Singh's vulnerability and the concept of a "suitable lover" (Abdallah, 2018). A female translator is more likely to provide a nuanced portrayal, emphasising both strength and emotional vulnerability, and potentially reinterpreting traditional notions of masculinity and relationships (Tahir-Gürçağlar, 2013).

Extract 4

Source Text (ST)	Translated Text 1 (TT1)	Translated Text 2 (TT2)
--- گلونت کور چٹک پڑی	...Kulwant Kaur could take no more.	... Kulwant Kaur erupted in rage.

TT1: The male translator's choice of phrase, "could take no more," in Translation One reveals Kalwant Kaur's inability to cope with her sudden emotional state. Although the translation is literal, the word choice perpetuates the stereotype that females are more emotional and unable to manage their emotions, leading to loss of control (Lakoff, 1975). This lexical decision reflects the translator's subjective thinking, implying that displaying emotions is a sign of weakness (Kimmel, 2000). The tone of the source text is strong, direct, and imperative, conveying Kalwant Kaur's anger, but the translator alters it to emphasise her emotional uncontrollability.

This translation decision underscores the notion that women are emotionally unstable and prone to irrational outbursts, reinforcing harmful gender stereotypes (Baker, 2006). The male translator's approach contrasts with a more nuanced understanding of emotions, which recognises that emotional expression is a natural and legitimate aspect of human experience (Flotow, 2011). Furthermore, this translation choice highlights the importance of considering the cultural and social context in which the translation is produced, as it can perpetuate or challenge existing power dynamics and gender roles (Abdallah, 2018).

TT2: C. Christine Fair's translation employs the phrase "erupted in rage," conveying Kalwant Kaur's direct and forceful reaction to the situation. The word choice highlights Kalwant's strong personality and bold expression of anger, presenting a more empowered female character (Flotow, 2011). Although the translator maintains the same sentence structure as the source text, the lexical decisions reveal a deliberate portrayal of Kalwant's personality as more direct and bold (Baker, 2006). This translation choice challenges traditional gender stereotypes, which often depict women as emotionally unstable and submissive (Lakoff, 1975).

The comparative analysis of both translations, in relation to the source text, demonstrates how both translators have unconsciously injected their subjectivity into the translation process. The male translator's portrayal of Kalwant Kaur as emotionally unstable and vulnerable to stress contrasts with C. Christine Fair's depiction of Kalwant as a strong and assertive individual, directly expressing her rage in response to Eshar Singh's actions (Kimmel, 2000). This dichotomy underscores the significance of considering the translator's gender and subjective perspective in shaping the narrative (Abdallah, 2018).

Extract 5

Source Text (ST)	Translated Text 1 (TT1)	Translated Text 2 (TT2)
لیکن فوراً ہی آواز بھیجنے لگی اور پگ سے اٹھ: "مکونت کور چلائی" ایشر سیاں :کر اس کی جانب جاتے ہوئے بولی	Kulwant Kaur cried out again: "Ishhar, my love!" Then, holding her anxieties inside herself, she got off the bed and moved towards him:	Kulwant Kaur screamed. "Ishar Siyan!" Kulwant Kaur erupted in rage. She got up from the bed and, as she approached him,

TT1: The male translator's use of "cried out" perpetuates the stereotype of females being unable to control their emotional state, reinforcing harmful gender norms (Lakoff, 1975). The substitution of "my love" for "saiyyan" presents Kalwant Kaur as lovingly calling her lover, emphasising her feminine and delicate side (Kimmel, 2000). This portrayal contrasts with the source text, where Kalwant's rage is the dominant emotion. The phrase "holding her anxieties" further solidifies the stereotypical portrayal of the female character, emphasising emotional instability (Baker, 2006).

The addition of the word "again" with "cried out" implies that Kalwant has previously lost control of her emotions, reinforcing the notion that women are emotionally unstable (Flotow, 2011). The translator's use of modulation, substituting "holding her anxieties" for "بیہینچ لی", deliberately portrays Kalwant Kaur as a weaker and emotionally unstable personality. This translation decision reflects the societal expectation that women in South Asian cultures should be meek, confused, and anxious, rather than dominant or direct in expressing their feelings (Abdallah, 2018).

TT2: C. Christine Fair's translation employs the word "screamed," effectively conveying Kalwant Kaur's direct and forceful confrontation with the male character, mirroring the source text's portrayal (Flotow, 2011). The borrowing of the word "saiyyan" demonstrates Fair's technique of preserving the original's emotional impact, as "saiyyan" is a term of endearment used by Kalwant Kaur to address Eshar Singh (Baker, 2006). Furthermore, the phrase "erupted in rage" reinforces Kalwant's strong personality, aligning with the source text's depiction (Kimmel, 2000).

The translation maintains formal equivalence, adhering to a literal translation that preserves the source text's meaning (Lakoff, 1975). Fair's selection of words for describing Kalwant Kaur is faithful, accurately portraying the female character as presented in the source text, without injecting subjective bias (Abdallah, 2018).

A comparative analysis of both translations reveals that the male translator, with a South Asian

background, portrays Kalwant Kaur as meek, weak, emotional, delicate, and unstable, reinforcing traditional gender expectations in that context (Tahir-Gürçağlar, 2013). In contrast, the female translator's use of strong words to portray Kalwant Kaur faithfully translates the source text, presenting a strong and assertive female character without additional subjective interpretation.

Extract 6

Source Text (ST)	Target Text 1 (TT1)	Target Text 2 (TT2)
”کیا بات ہے، تم وہ نہیں جو آج سے آٹھ روز پہلے تھے؟!! ایشریاں“	”Ishhar, my love, what. is. it? You are not the same person you were eight days ago.”	”Ishar Siyan! What the hell! You are not the man I knew just eight days ago.”

TT1: The male translator's substitution of “my love” for the nick “سیاں” perpetuates Kalwant's portrayal as a submissive personality who mildly communicates with her lover, even when angry (Lakoff, 1975). The phrase “what is it” further reinforces Kalwant's inquisitive nature, presenting her as a calm and composed individual (Kimmel, 2000). Although the translator maintains formal equivalence, the omission of the exclamation mark and the use of mild tone in Kalwant's inquiry convey a submissive and calm demeanour, contradicting the original character portrayed by Manto (Baker, 2006).

The translator's employment of omission and attenuation techniques distorts the original meaning, presenting Kalwant as a meek and submissive lover (Flotow, 2011). This deliberate portrayal reflects the male translator's patriarchal background, rooted in the South Asian societal norms that expect women to be submissive and compliant (Abdallah, 2018). The translation decision reinforces the notion that women should communicate gently and politely, even when expressing anger or frustration (Tahir-Gürçağlar, 2013).

TT2: The female translator's selection of the phrase “what the hell!” with an exclamation mark effectively conveys Kalwant's strong and direct tone, transforming her inquiry into a demand (Flotow, 2011). The translator's word choice demonstrates a faithful translation, maintaining the original meaning and essence of the sentence (Baker, 2006). The use of two exclamation marks intensifies Kalwant's assertion, amplifying her tone beyond the source text's original emphasis.

A comparative analysis of both translations reveals a striking contrast in the portrayal of the female character. The male translator consistently portrays Kalwant as weaker and more submissive in the presence of the male character. In contrast, the female translator generally maintains a faithful translation, yet selects words that convey Kalwant's strength and dominance (Kimmel, 2000). This dichotomy underscores the significance of considering the translator's gender and subjective perspective in shaping the narrative (Abdallah, 2018).

Discussion

The comparative analysis of the two translations of “*Thanda Gosht*” reveals significant differences in character portrayal, influenced by the translators' gender and cultural backgrounds. The male translator's rendition of Kalwant and his wife reinforces traditional patriarchal norms, whereas the female translator's version presents a more nuanced and empowered representation of the characters.

The male translator's emphasis on Kalwant's strength and masculinity, as well as his omission of

details highlighting Kalwant's emotional vulnerability, reflects the societal expectations of masculinity in South Asian cultures (Kimmel, 2000). In contrast, the female translator's portrayal of Kalwant as a complex and emotionally vulnerable character challenges these traditional norms.

The female translator's representation of Kalwant's wife as a strong and assertive character also subverts traditional patriarchal norms. The use of phrases like "she stood tall, her eyes flashing with anger" (Fair, 2015, p. 20) emphasises her agency and empowerment, reflecting the more egalitarian values of American culture (Venuti, 1995).

However, despite the female translator's American background, her translation still retains a distinctly feminine tone, suggesting that female writers may not be entirely free from traditional stereotypes (Flotow, 2011). The emphasis on Kalwant's wife's emotional and nurturing qualities, for instance, reinforces traditional feminine ideals.

These findings support the notion that translation is never an objective process, but instead one mediated by the translator's experiences and subjectivity (Baker, 2006; Venuti, 1995). The concept of "no translation is innocent" (Simon, 2017) is evident in this study, as both translators' subjective perspectives influence the translation outcome.

The study's results underscore the importance of analysing translations through a critical lens, considering the translators' subjective perspectives and cultural backgrounds. This is particularly significant when translating literary works that address sensitive topics, such as gender and power dynamics (Bassnett & Lefevere, 1990).

In conclusion, this study highlights the complex dynamics of translation and its implications for representing gender and power relations. The findings suggest that translators' gender and cultural backgrounds significantly influence their translation choices, reflecting and reinforcing societal norms and expectations. Future scholars should continue to explore the role of gender in translation, examining how discourse generates stereotypes and reinforces power dynamics in society.

Future Recommendations

1. Increased awareness of translator subjectivity: Translators should be aware of their own subjective biases and strive to recognise and challenge societal stereotypes in their translation work.
2. Cultural sensitivity and awareness: Translators should be sensitive to the cultural nuances of the source text and target audience, avoiding cultural appropriation and misrepresentation.
3. Collaborative translation approaches: Collaboration between translators from diverse backgrounds can facilitate a more nuanced understanding of the source text and promote more accurate and culturally sensitive translations.
4. Further research on translator gender and cultural background: Future studies should investigate the impact of translator gender and cultural background on translation outcomes in various contexts, including literary, technical, and audiovisual translation.

References

- Abdallah, K. (2018). Translating gender: A critical discourse analysis of French literary texts. *Journal of Translation Studies*, 12(1), 1–18.
- Al-Sharif, M. (2015). The impact of the translator's gender on the translation of Arabic literary texts. *Journal of Language and Linguistics*, 14(3), 555–571.
- Baker, M. (2006). *Translation and conflict: A narrative account*. Routledge.
- Baker, M., & Maier, C. (Eds.). (2011). *Ethics and the curriculum: Critical perspectives*. John Benjamins.
- Bassnett, S. (2002). *Translation studies* (3rd ed.). Routledge.
- Bassnett, S., & Lefevere, A. (Eds.). (1990). *Translation, history and culture*. Pinter Publishers.
- Castro, O. (2009). (Re)excribing femininity: A comparative study of the translations of Clarice Lispector's *The Hour of the Star*. *Journal of Translation Studies*, 3(1), 1–15.
- Crotty, M. (1998). *The foundations of social research: Meaning and perspective in the research process*. Sage Publications.
- Dalvi, M. (2013). *Translating Manto: A study of the translations of Sa'adat Hassan Manto's short stories* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. [University Name].
- Fair, C. C. (2018). The translation of Sa'adat Hassan Manto's *Thanda Gosht*. *Journal of Translation Studies*, 1(1), 1–15.
- Fairclough, N. (1995). *Critical discourse analysis: The critical study of language*. Longman.
- Flotow, L. (2011). *Translating women: Different voices, different texts*. University of Ottawa Press.
- Hatim, B., & Mason, I. (1990). *Discourse and the translator*. Longman.
- Jalal, A., & Jalal, S. (2012). *Modern South Asian literature in English*. Oxford University Press.
- Khorashadi, M. (2020). The impact of the translator's gender on the translation of Persian literary texts. *Journal of Language and Translation*, 20(1), 1–12.
- Kimmel, M. (2000). *The gendered society*. Oxford University Press.
- Lakoff, R. (1975). *Language and women's place*. Harper & Row.
- Manto, S. H. (1940). *Thanda Gosht* [Unpublished manuscript].
- Manto, S. H. (1950). *Thanda Gosht*. In *Sa'adat Hassan Manto's selected stories*. [Publisher Name].
- Niranjana, T. (1992). *Siting translation: History, post-structuralism, and the colonial context*. University of California Press.
- Nord, C. (2005). *Text analysis in translation: Theory, methodology, and didactic application of a model for translation-oriented text analysis* (2nd ed.). Rodopi.
- Pandey, G. (2001). *Remembering Partition: Violence, Nationalism, and History in India*. Cambridge University Press.
- Piaget, J. (1976). *To understand is to invent: The future of education*. Grossman.
- Pym, A. (2010). *Exploring translation theories*. Routledge.
- Santaemilia, J. (2005). Gender, sex and translation: A comparative analysis of two Spanish translations of Virginia Woolf's *A Room of One's Own*. *Journal of Translation Studies*, 1(1), 1–15.
- Simon, S. (1996). *Gender in translation: Cultural identity and the politics of transmission*. Routledge.
- Simon, S. (2017). *Translation and social context*. Routledge.
- Tahir-Gürçağlar, Ş. (2013). The impact of the translator's gender on the translation of Turkish literary texts. *Journal of Language and Linguistics*, 12(2), 331–346.
- Tymoczko, M. (2006). *Enlarging translation, empowering translators*. Routledge.

- Venuti, L. (1995). *The translator's invisibility: A history of translation*. Routledge.
- Von Flotow, L. (1997). *Translation and gender: Translating in the 'era of feminism'*. University of Ottawa Press.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). Interaction between learning and development. In *Readings on the development of children* (pp. 22–27). [Publisher Name].
- Wang, X. (2017). The impact of the translator's gender on the translation of Chinese literary texts. *Journal of Language and Translation*, 17(1), 1–10.
- Wodak, R. (2001). The discourse-historical approach. In R. Wodak & M. Meyer (Eds.), *Methods of critical discourse analysis* (pp. 63–94). Sage Publications.