

INSTITUTIONAL REFORM THROUGH AUTHORITY MODELS: RETHINKING CORPORATE GOVERNANCE IN PAKISTAN'S PUBLIC SECTOR

Muhammad Rizwan Safdar

Assistant Professor Sociology, Institute of Social and Cultural Studies,
University of the Punjab
drrizwansafdar.iscs@pu.edu.pk

Abstract

This paper investigates institutional reform in Pakistan's public sector through the lens of authority-based governance models, with a specific focus on the Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority (PSBA). As the only government welfare organization in Pakistan to successfully transition from a Section 42 company into a fully statutory institution, PSBA demonstrates how legal empowerment, strategic leadership, and operational innovation can drive sustainable public service delivery. Using a qualitative documentary case-study approach, this study triangulates evidence from legislative texts, government records, independent audits, daily pricing data, and verified media sources to evaluate PSBA's legal, financial, and operational performance. Under the strategic leadership of Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad, PSBA implemented transformative initiatives, including solar-powered markets, real-time digital price displays, women-inclusive vendor policies, and mobile bazaars serving underserved regions. These interventions enabled the Authority to provide essential goods at prices up to 35% below market rates without reliance on subsidies. The findings position PSBA as a transparent, citizen-responsive, and legally empowered institution, offering a replicable framework for institutional reform, governance innovation, and public welfare enhancement in emerging economies.

Keywords: Institutional Reforms, Authority, Models, Governance, Public Sector, Pakistan, Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad

1. Introduction

1.1 Reimagining Governance in the Public Sector

Governance failures in developing economies often stem from the rigid frameworks of state-owned enterprises and public companies that are legally and financially constrained. In Pakistan, the limitations of Section 42 companies set up under the Companies Act for public service delivery have long impeded innovation, agility, and sustainable impact. These companies are legally independent but practically dependent on government subsidies, sluggish bureaucratic oversight, and outdated procurement structures. Efforts at reform have often lacked structural boldness, focusing on surface-level adjustments rather than systemic reinvention.

In this institutional void, the transformation of the Punjab Model Bazaars Management Company (PMBMC) into the Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority (PSBA) represents a rare and exemplary act of governance reform. Through a legislative act passed by the Punjab Assembly in 2025, this transition is the first successful conversion of a Section 42 company into a full statutory authority in Pakistan's history. It sets a precedent for rethinking public-sector institutional design by aligning legal empowerment, operational autonomy, and welfare efficiency in a single governance model.

1.2 From Section 42 to Statutory Authority: A First-in-Pakistan Governance Reform

The passage of the Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority Act, 2025, signified far more than a legal upgrade; it represented a paradigm shift. The new authority framework eliminated long-standing bottlenecks around procurement, budgeting, and vendor management that had plagued PMBMC under its corporate structure.

What makes this transition historic is its non-replicable nature. As noted in the Baker Tilly benchmarking report (2025), no other Section 42 entity had previously achieved such transformation. Peer organizations such as LWMC, PHIMC, PEEF, and PFA continue to

operate without statutory autonomy, relying heavily on subsidies or donor assistance. PSBA, by contrast, is financially self-sustaining, digitally enabled, and legally independent a combination not previously seen in Pakistan's public welfare ecosystem.

1.3 Leadership as a Catalyst for Institutional Innovation

This shift from a dependent, subsidy-bound entity to a legislatively empowered authority is inseparable from the visionary leadership of Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad, who served first as CFO of PMBMC and now as Director General of PSBA. His contributions were not merely administrative but transformational, as confirmed by independent audit reviews (Baker Tilly, 2025) and media analysis (ProPakistani, 2025; The Nation, 2025). Ahmad's strategic design of the conversion policy, legislative coordination, and digital infrastructure rollout directly addressed the institutional dysfunctions that had crippled PMBMC.

Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad's leadership in converting the Punjab Model Bazaars Management Company into the Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority represents a novel governance reform of major field-wide significance. Prior to his work, Pakistan had not successfully transitioned a corporate-structured welfare entity into a statutory authority. His model is now cited in policy discussions and institutional reports as a precedent for improving accountability and autonomy in public governance. This demonstrates that his contribution has transcended his institution and created a replicable framework for governance reform across South Asia.

1.4 Enablers of the Transition: Factors Behind the Reform's Success

The success of this governance reform was driven by three interlocking factors:

a. Visionary and Critical Leadership

Ahmad's role was not routine it was central. His work is now being referenced in academic research, government planning documents, and policy dialogues as a model of governance redesign that blends business acumen with public responsibility.

b. Legislative and Governmental Endorsement

The Punjab government not only enacted the PSBA Act but backed it with massive financial investments including a Rs. 3.44 billion ADP allocation in 2024 for 13 bazaars, followed by an unprecedented Rs. 10 billion in 2025–26 to scale to 100 bazaars. This institutional vote of confidence empowered PSBA to expand operations, develop technology, and attract vendor partnerships.

c. Oversight and Legal Infrastructure

Statutory authority allowed for transparent and multi-level oversight through a board comprising civil servants, elected officials, and technical experts. Procurement, hiring, and expansion decisions now operate under the law, free from bureaucratic inertia.

1.5 Outcomes: Efficiency, Innovation, and Impact at Scale

The PSBA model has already delivered measurable, wide-scale results:

- 36 bazaars operational across 25 districts
- Price relief up to 35% below market, and 7% below DC-notified rates
- 85,000+ free home delivery orders fulfilled
- Solarization pilots reducing energy costs by 90%
- 50% vendor stall discounts for women entrepreneurs
- Digital ordering apps launched in 2025 (Android + iOS)

These are not piecemeal improvements they represent systemic transformation. PSBA's services now reach over 50 million citizens annually, with a model that is both financially sustainable and scalable. (Solochoicez Report, Page 31; Baker Tilly Performance Audit, Pages 36–37)

1.6 Independent Validation and National-Level Replication Potential

PSBA's success is not just internally claimed it is externally validated. Baker Tilly ranked it #1 among 14 peer institutions in governance, financial sustainability, and innovation. The

composite benchmarking score: 86/100, with PSBA outperforming traditional Section 42 bodies in every domain. In addition, Punjab's Planning & Development Board and multiple local governments are now studying PSBA's transformation as a possible blueprint for decentralization, subsidy-free welfare, and market-oriented governance.

1.7 Toward a Scalable Governance Reform Framework

This transition provides answers to the very research questions posed:

- Institutional Factors: The reform succeeded because of committed leadership, political will, legal transformation, and performance metrics.
- Governance Improvement: Authority-based models eliminate red tape and foster transparency and autonomy.
- Scalability: PSBA now stands as a national precedent, capable of replication in other provinces and even regional governments.

As one media outlet rightly noted, 'From white elephant to flagship institution PSBA didn't just evolve. It redefined public welfare.' UrduPoint, 2025

1.8 Research Objectives

- To identify the institutional, legal, and leadership factors that enabled the transformation of a Section 42 company into a statutory authority in Pakistan.
- To evaluate how authority-based governance structures enhance accountability, transparency, and fiscal autonomy in public welfare delivery.
- To assess the PSBA model's scalability and potential as a framework for institutional reform in developing public sectors.

1.9 Research Questions

Q.1 What institutional factors enable the successful transition of public companies into statutory authorities in Pakistan?

Q.2 How do authority-based governance structures improve accountability, transparency, and operational autonomy in the public sector?

Q.3 In what ways does the PSBA model reflect a scalable framework for corporate governance reform in developing contexts?

1.10 Significance of the Study

This study is significant as it explores a groundbreaking institutional reform within Pakistan's public sector the conversion of a Section 42 welfare company into a statutory authority. By analyzing the case of the Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority (PSBA), the research demonstrates how authority-based governance can improve legal legitimacy, financial autonomy, and public service delivery. The study contributes to the literature on public administration, offering a replicable model for transforming subsidy-dependent institutions into sustainable, accountable bodies. It is particularly relevant for developing countries seeking to reform legacy institutions through legislative innovation and market-based governance. The findings provide insight for policymakers, governance reformers, and development economists working on institutional redesign. Furthermore, this work advances discourse on leadership-driven reform and field-wide impact beyond organizational boundaries.

1.11 Delimitation of the Study

This study is delimited to the case of the Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority (PSBA) and its transformation from a Section 42 company into a statutory authority in Punjab, Pakistan. It does not examine other public sector organizations or Section 42 companies in detail, though comparative references are included for context. The focus remains on institutional, legal, and governance reforms within the public welfare and retail service delivery sectors. The geographical scope is limited to Punjab province, and the time frame covers developments from 2020 to 2025. Financial data, media reports, third-party audits (e.g., Baker Tilly), and policy documents are used, but primary interviews and ethnographic fieldwork are excluded. The

study is conceptual-analytical, aiming to inform policy and academic debate rather than offer an operational manual.

1.12 Data Collection

The data collection strategy for this study was multi-sourced, document-based, and designed to reflect both institutional and performance dimensions of PSBA's governance model. The primary data sources included:

- Legal and Policy Documents: The Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority Act, 2025 was analyzed in detail to assess changes in legal authority, governance structure, and statutory autonomy. The Punjab ADP (Annual Development Programme) allocations for FY 2024 and FY 2025–26 were also reviewed to understand fiscal commitments and government endorsement.
- Independent Audits and Performance Reports: Key insights were drawn from the Baker Tilly benchmarking report (2025), which assessed PSBA against 14 peer welfare organizations. This report provided standardized scores on governance, financial sustainability, and service delivery. The Solochoicez institutional review (2025) was also used to extract data on solarization, vendor policy, free home delivery volumes, and public reach.
- Secondary Media Data: Verified news content from outlets like ProPakistani, The Nation, Minute Mirror, UrduPoint, and Tribune was used to document public recognition, national influence, and real-time implementation feedback. These sources helped validate PSBA's national impact and leadership performance without relying on self-reported claims.

Together, these triangulated sources enabled a comprehensive and reliable assessment of PSBA's reform trajectory.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Institutional Transformation and Governance of PSBA

The Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority (PSBA) has transformed to be a historical example of institutional invention, welfare transformation and restructuring governance in the Indian retail industry. In the last ten years, a literature on the ways in which the PSBA has managed to grow into stronger forms of a statutory agency, rather than a Section 42 company, producing subsidized basic goods and still being operationally efficient and financially independent and citizen-directed in its governance has emerged. The analysts always distinguish the major aspect of this transformation, which has adopted the legal empowerment, digital innovation, and interwoven operational policies, as strategic command of Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad as a representative of the public welfare replicability.

The bazaar model will be at a position to satirize the congruency of products and consumer preference. The participants will also tend to be consumers and producers, and offer solutions, which will depend on their needs. Through this the individual knowledge of people is rendered visible by the governance of bazaar instead of being vulnerable to market forces such as to prices. An example, fab labs offer computer controlled machines, including cutting machines, milling machines, and laser cutters (Gershenfeld, 2005). Using this access, the participants are able to create individual projects and objects that could not be found in the traditional markets. Although fab labs may not have the scale economies of mass production, they can serve niche markets due to their ability to spread knowledge within the community and through its wider network and can produce a long tail of unique products (Anderson, 2013).

The rule in the form of bazaar of open societies becomes reduced to two fundamental notions. To begin with it is a system of government and it has an established contractual basis as any other system of government. It is particularly steered by the explicit or implicit consent that allows the members of the open community to use, reproduce, modify, contribute or share

various resources, most often information and knowledge, but also tangible commodities. In contrast to other governing forms, the bazaar model does not allow the contributors to appropriate the common assets in totality as they would in the firm (individual ownership) or in a network (collective ownership). (Demil & Warnier, 2013)

The peculiarity of the bazaar is the strange one, that of the openness. Transparency is now being perceived as the lack of interlocking up to the involvement in a manner close to perfect form of democracy (Lessig, 1999). Participation is founded on the choice to participate i.e. the members are not imposed to participate, they are more likely to do it on their own will, a community part. This contrasts with other types of organization: the recruiting of new members is going on, joining a market involves breaking some barriers and membership in a network is generally a pre-requisite and involves co-optation or invitation into the group. (Afuah and Tucci, 2012).

2.2 Operational Innovations and Service Delivery

The institutional change of PSBA is described somewhat by Safdar (2024) including how this organization has now become a statutory organization (Formerly a Section 42 company). The paper mentions the introduction of solar-powered infrastructure, real-time digital price boards, women are covered in their vendor policies, and none of them is subsidized by the Authority. These, along with other efforts, not only added value to service delivery, but also transformed PSBA into an open, accountable and legally empowered body. With the analysis done by Safdar the reforms that the leadership spearheaded led to high consumer benefit since the prices were always maintained at less than 35 percent of the market rates which showed how the organization could not only be fiscally efficient but social as well. The paper highlights that the PSBA model might be replicated by other developing economies and the importance of the statutory enabling the visionary leadership about sustainable institutional reforms.

It is on this basis that Sarwar (2025) continues his exploration of the business and operation model that is specific to PSBA. His work is based on the qualitative documentary case study, and triangulated by legislative texts, government documents, independent audit, daily pricing statistics and media reviews. Sarwar concludes PSBA has both legal empowerment and strategic governance that will enable it to be highly efficient and be competitive in the market despite providing its services to the underprivileged and remote populations. The Authority under the rule of Ahmad has made mobile bazaars and non-discriminatory policies between vendors the only way to empower women traders. This form of pricing and solar powered market infrastructure development by PSBA have resulted in a robust system that will act to ensure the affordability and quality of services remain subsidy free. The article supports the fact that institutional performance in the emerging economies is a transparency ride, design and legal support ride with citizen focus.

Comparatively, Shehzad (2025) compares the performance of PSBA as compared to the performance of the traditional welfare institutes, especially the utility Stores Corporation (USC) that does not exist today at all. Through official reports, legislation, third-party analysis, and independent media, Shehzad discloses that PSBA is rated higher in relation to the most substantial factors of the affordability, accessibility, efficiency, and governance relative to USC. The paper identifies dynamic pricing boards as a transformational board because it is solar powered and mobile bazaars that depict the cost-efficiency of innovations of PSBA, and the being socially inclusive. Shehzad provides the principle of the citizen-responsive model of the Authority that is backed by the statutory power and digital innovations and presents PSBA as the example of the institutional alteration and explains the opportunity to follow the same tendencies in the other developing nations.

2.3 Comparative Analysis and Social Impact

Hussain (2024) takes note to the affordability programmes of PSBA such as the regular supply of the basic commodities at the lower levels compared to the ones provided by the government. With an overlay of quantitative figures in a document-based approach to qualitative study, Hussain assesses the legal form, the monetary independence, and the executing governing in the Authority. The most crucial part of the analysis is the affordability model of Ahmad since it guaranteed that low-income and underserved groups could make ends meet. The results indicate PSBA as the citizen responsive and non-routine institution, which entails transformation leadership and the statutory power to facilitate market efficiency and interest of the people. The research by Hussein also supports the fact that operational innovations, like solarized bazaars, vendor-inclusive policy, and digital price boards, directly positively influence the sustainability and replicability of the model of PSBA.

Hassan (2024) makes a more in-depth comparative study of the two PSBA and USC and reported that PSBA has a better institutional performance. The research records more than 85,000 free home deliveries, mobile bazaars in the rural community and 95 percent subsidized stalls on the side of the women vendors. PSBA has been able to replicate up to 35 per cent savings to the consumer by introducing new digital networks, solar powered plants, open supply chains and also providing basic commodities to all equally. Hassan concludes that these transformational ventures combined with strategic leadership make PSBA a model worth emulating as a model of citizen-based, empowered by law, and technologically dynamic, public service provision.

As the marketing strategies are evolving Ahmad (2025) made a comparison of consumer engagement strategy of traditional companies and online companies that are founded on principles of e-commerce. The researchers came to the conclusion that the e-commerce companies can more easily gain and keep customers through customized content, target marketing, and real-time data analytics. Traditional business, however, is more likely to employ more generalized marketing techniques which are not so sensitive to the evolving consumer behavior. In one of his works, Ahmad (2025) discovered the digital innovation in the logistics sector and explored how new technologies of artificial intelligence, blockchain and the Internet of Things can facilitate the enhancement of the effectiveness of the supply chain in the e-commerce sector. It was also found that the technologies positively affect the accuracy of the inventory, simplification of the order process, and the fact that it is possible to trace the goods and services in real-time, and it will eventually lead to the reduction of costs and increase in customer satisfaction. When it comes to discussing the change of the role of services offered by the Punjab Model Bazaars, Ahmad (2025) considered the shift of the role of Punjab Model Bazaars as a complex of firms to the role of the authority in the form of a government. This research discovered that this change has contributed to heightened transparency, better functioning of operations and augmented citizen satisfaction that ultimately resulted in enhancement of trust of the people.

2.4 Digital Transformation, E-Commerce, and Financial Innovation

According to the consumerism within the online markets, Ahmad (2025) performed a qualitative investigation of the repeat buying behavior of the prominent online purchasing platforms in Pakistan such as, Dareza or OLX. Quality of the products offered, safe payment systems, quality of the customer service and experiences in the past are some of the factors that were found to drive towards consumer loyalty. The research paper has attributed the significance of trust and reliability in delivering services in the long run customer relationships in competitive online markets. Ahmad (2025) has already captured the current position of fintech startups in the Pakistani financial ecosystem and the role of the startups in creating innovations and enhancing access to financial services. The paper has developed the fact that Fintech companies are changing the industry because they provide digital solutions to make

transactions more convenient, increase consumer trust and make financial services more available. The further development of this sphere that will be sustainable, however, is preconditioned by the effective control, data security, and the further evolution of the technologies.

Ahmad (2025) in her article talks about the application of artificial intelligence within the supply chain sector in Pakistan and how artificial intelligence has been applied to streamline the demand forecasting process, inventory and logistics management. After the interviews about the big industries, the research discovers that AI is providing the decision-making more responsive and advanced. Limitations that have facilitated its adoption even though it is an effective strategy are lack of technical abilities, funds, outdated systems and change resistance. Ahmad dedicates attention to the aspect of leadership, training employees, and the culture of innovation and makes a conclusion that the effects of AI are determined by the long-term investment and situational-based digital strategy.

Another aspect that Aamir (2025) develops is the governance and access to the market variables of PSBA and its non-identity with traditional welfare organizations. The article elucidates the manner the governance system that is amiable to citizens, legally-ratified, and provides transparency, accountability and good service delivery at PSBA. The transformative interventions that Aamir records are price boards in real-time, infrastructure powered by the sun, non-discriminatory policies towards traders that accept women, and mobile bazaars that are affordable to underserved people. The paper has proven that the combination of price control, digital innovations, and services delivery with the subsequent PSBA leads to a high level of consumer benefit with discount rates reaching 35 percent relative to the overall market rates. Now Aamir concludes that the model of PSBA can be not only operationally effective, but it can be imitated by the other developing economies which need solutions of innovative public welfare.

3. Research Methodology

This study employs a qualitative case study methodology to examine the transformation of the Punjab Model Bazaars Management Company (PMBMC) into the Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority (PSBA). The case study design is chosen due to its capacity to offer an in-depth, context-rich understanding of a unique and unprecedented governance reform in Pakistan's public sector. The focus is not merely on descriptive institutional history but on analytical insights into how governance, legal frameworks, and operational models can be reimagined through authority-based institutional design. The study investigates the PSBA transformation through the lens of three well-established theoretical frameworks: New Public Management (NPM), Neo-Institutionalism, and Public Value Theory. These provide a multi-dimensional foundation for analyzing the transition from a Section 42 company to a statutory authority in terms of accountability, autonomy, efficiency, legitimacy, and scalability.

The unit of analysis is PSBA as a public-sector entity. Analytical triangulation is achieved through three types of qualitative evidence:

- Documentary review of official legislative acts, government ADP allocations, and statutory regulations
- Third-party audit reports and benchmarking data (e.g., Baker Tilly performance audit, Solochoicez institutional review)
- Narrative content analysis of credible national media coverage and public commentary (e.g., ProPakistani, The Nation, ARY News, UrduPoint)

The study is inherently interpretive, aiming to identify causal mechanisms and institutional dynamics rather than generalize across all public organizations. However, comparative remarks are made by referencing peer institutions such as LWMC, PEEF, PFA, and PRSP to situate PSBA's reforms within the wider ecosystem of Pakistan's public welfare infrastructure.

The research methodology is non-interventionist and non-experimental. It does not rely on primary field interviews, survey instruments, or real-time ethnography, although such approaches could be considered for longitudinal follow-ups. Instead, it synthesizes already existing and verifiable sources to derive institutional insights. This approach ensures credibility, verifiability, and alignment with public data available to researchers, policy analysts, and institutional reformers.

4. Analysis

4.1 Structural Shift from Corporate to Statutory Governance

The transformation of the Punjab Model Bazaars Management Company (PMBMC) into the Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority (PSBA) represents a paradigmatic shift in Pakistan's governance landscape. PMBMC, established as a Section 42 company, was inherently limited by its corporate legal structure lacking legislative backing, procurement autonomy, and financial independence. In contrast, PSBA was legislatively constituted through the Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority Act, 2025, granting it full statutory authority, making it the first welfare-focused Section 42 company in Pakistan to undergo such a conversion. As per Baker Tilly's 2025 performance audit, this conversion has "no precedent" among 14 peer institutions and marks a field-wide innovation in public sector governance. The shift was not cosmetic but substantive delivering changes in legal standing, operational capability, accountability mechanisms, and strategic scope.

4.2 Legal Empowerment and Legislative Integration

The PSBA Act granted the authority powers previously unavailable to PMBMC. These include:

- Independent procurement processes without reliance on parent departments
- Statutory budgeting with ADP integration
- Legislative oversight via a diversified board comprising secretaries, elected officials, and technical experts

This structure ensures both operational flexibility and institutional accountability, correcting the dual failures of political interference and bureaucratic stagnation that plague most Section 42 bodies.

4.3 Financial Sustainability and Budget Independence

A major hallmark of PSBA's reform was its subsidy-free model. Under PMBMC, funding was irregular and entirely dependent on government grants. In contrast, PSBA now operates:

- Without any recurring subsidies
- Through own-source revenue from vendor stall fees and bulk procurement economies
- With multi-billion-rupee capital expansion grants (Rs. 3.44 billion in 2024, Rs. 10 billion in FY 2025–26)

This shift is not merely financial it structurally changes how public goods are delivered. PSBA is able to offer average price relief of 35% below open market, and up to 7% below Deputy Commissioner-notified rates, without relying on government subsidies.

4.4 Impact Metrics: Quantitative Evidence of Reform Success

The following table summarizes before-and-after comparisons of key institutional performance indicators:

Performance Indicator	Before (PMBMC)	After (PSBA)
Legal Status	Section 42 Company	Statutory Authority

Price Relief (avg. % below market)	10%	35% (up to 7% below DC rates)
Free Home Deliveries Fulfilled	0	85,000+
District Coverage	6 districts	25 districts
Annual Beneficiaries	10 million	50 million+
Energy Cost Reduction (via Solar)	None	Up to 90%
Women Vendor Participation Discount	None	50% stall discount
Government Subsidy Dependency	High	None
Annual Public Funding (ADP)	Rs. 0.9 Billion	Rs. 10 Billion (FY 2025–26)
Benchmarking Score (Baker Tilly)	Unranked	86/100 (Top among 14 peers)

4.5 Technological Innovation as Governance Leverage

PSBA's transition included full-scale technological modernization:

- Android/iOS Apps: Enabling real-time ordering of subsidized goods
- Mobile Bazaars ("Sahulat on the Go"): 14 operational units serving underserved regions
- Free Home Delivery Network: 85,000+ orders completed through a custom-built logistics system
- Solarization Program: Utility cost reductions up to 90% in pilot bazaars

This leap from analog bureaucracy to digital service delivery repositions PSBA as South Asia's most digitized public market network.

4.6 Social Equity and Gender Inclusion

One of the most innovative reforms under PSBA is its integration of social equity mechanisms:

- 50% stall fee discounts for women entrepreneurs
- All-vendor access models ensuring micro-retailers can compete
- Province-wide price relief, particularly for low-income urban and peri-urban populations

These programs move beyond economic efficiency to address systemic inequality in public access and vendor participation.

4.7 Benchmarking and Peer Validation

Independent auditing by Baker Tilly positioned PSBA as the top-ranked institution among 14 public welfare entities, with an overall score of 86/100:

Table 1: Benchmarking and Peer Validation

Category	PSBA Score	Rank Among Peers
Governance	84	1 st
Financial Sustainability	90	1 st
Service Delivery	83	2 nd
Overall Composite Score	86	1 st

In contrast, entities like LWMC, PFA, and PRSP scored in the mid-60s, lacking financial independence and digital integration.

4.8 Theoretical Alignment: New Public Management and Institutionalism

PSBA's reform aligns strongly with the New Public Management (NPM) framework, which advocates:

- Autonomy from political interference
- Performance-driven budgeting
- Citizen-focused service delivery

It also reflects Neo-Institutionalist thinking by reshaping not just policies, but the underlying institutional architecture converting legal form, redefining funding flows, and introducing performance benchmarks (Osborne & Gaebler, 1992; Pollitt & Bouckaert, 2004)

4.9 Scalability and Replicability

The PSBA model is now under review by:

- Punjab's Planning and Development Board
- Sindh and KP governments for potential adaptation
- Academic researchers, with citations already appearing in governance papers and casebooks

Its replication hinges on:

- A dedicated legislative framework
- Political backing
- Leadership with cross-sectoral insight

4.10 Additional Comparative Insights and Observations

- Institutional Autonomy: PSBA demonstrates higher autonomy in decision-making compared to traditional Section 42 companies like LWMC and PFA, which remain constrained by parent department approvals.
- Revenue Diversification: Unlike peer institutions, PSBA generates own-source revenue through stall fees and bulk procurement, reducing fiscal vulnerability.
- Digital Service Delivery: The mobile apps, home delivery, and solarization programs give PSBA a competitive advantage in efficiency and outreach compared to analog-based peers.
- Social Inclusion: PSBA's gender-focused vendor policies and open-access vendor model outperform peers, which rarely integrate targeted equity programs.

- Scalability Potential: PSBA's legislative framework and technological backbone make it highly replicable across other provinces, contingent on political backing and legal authority.

4.11 PSBA vs Peer Institutions (Governance, Financial Sustainability, Service Delivery Scores)

Table 2: PSBA vs Peer Institutions

Institution	Governance	Financial Sustainability	Service Delivery
PSBA	84	90	83
LWMC	65	62	66
PFA	64	60	65
PRSP	66	61	64

Table 3: Comparative Summary Table – Key Metrics Before and After PSBA

Metric	PMBMC	PSBA	Peer Average
Price Relief (% below market)	10	35	10
Annual Beneficiaries (Millions)	10	50	12–15
Government Subsidy Dependency	High	None	High
Digital Integration	None	Full (Apps, Mobile Bazaars)	Minimal
Women Vendor Participation	None	50% stall discount	None

5. Conclusion

The transformation of the Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority (PSBA) demonstrates that institutional reform is possible, even within bureaucratically complex systems, when it is grounded in law, performance, and strategic leadership. Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad's role in converting the Punjab Model Bazaars Management Company into PSBA represents a governance reform of major field-wide significance. Prior to his intervention, Pakistan had not successfully transitioned a corporate-structured welfare entity into a statutory authority. This reform showcases how authority-based models can unlock structural autonomy, improve fiscal discipline, and enhance public service delivery without reliance on recurring subsidies. Ahmad's model is now actively cited in policy discussions, institutional audits, and governance literature as a precedent for improving accountability and autonomy in public administration. By addressing each of the research questions with verifiable data, legislative analysis, and theoretical grounding, this case affirms that PSBA is not an isolated success, but a scalable and replicable framework for governance reinvention across South Asia.

References

Aamir, A. A. (2025). A Unique Model of Governance and Market Accessibility: How PSBA Stands Apart from All Other Public Welfare Bodies in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 13(2), 568–579.

Ahmad, N. R. (2025, July 10). *Punjab's Sahulat Bazaars transition to statutory authority with subsidy-free model*. ProPakistani. <https://propakistani.pk/2025/07/10/punjabs-sahulat-bazaars-transition-to-statutory-authority-with-subsidy-free-model/>

Ahmad, N. R. (2025, July 15). *Punjab sets national precedent: PSBA emerges as Pakistan's first statutory subsidy-free welfare authority*. ProPakistani. <https://propakistani.pk/2025/07/15/punjab-sets-national-precedent-psba-emerges-as-pakistans-first-statutory-subsidy-free-welfare-authority/>

Ahmad, N. R. (2025, July 8). *Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad delivers biggest breakthrough in PSBA's history*. The Nation. <https://www.nation.com.pk/08-Jul-2025/naveed-rafaqat-ahmad-delivers-biggest-breakthrough-in-psba-s-history>

Ahmad, N. R. (2025, March 19). *Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad leads Punjab's first company to authority transformation*. The Nation. <https://www.nation.com.pk/19-Mar-2025/naveed-rafaqat-ahmad-leads-punjab-s-first-company-to-authority-transformation>

Ahmad, N. R. (2025, May 7). *Punjab unveils mobile bazaars to cut prices—Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad at the helm*. The Nation. <https://www.nation.com.pk/07-May-2025/punjab-unveils-mobile-bazaars-to-cut-prices-naveed-rafaqat-ahmad-at-the-helm>

Ahmad, N. R. (2025a). Digital Marketing Strategies and Consumer Engagement: A Comparative Study of Traditional vs. E-Commerce Brands. *The Critical Review of Social Science Studies*, 3(1), 1–15.

Ahmad, N. R. (2025b). Exploring the Role of Digital Technologies in Enhancing Supply Chain Efficiency: A Case Study of E-Commerce Companies. *Indus Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(1), 23–38.

Ahmad, N. R. (2025c). Model Bazaars Redefined: Punjab's Visionary Step to Authority Status for Public Welfare. *Contemporary Journal of Social Sciences Review*, 3(1), 12–27.

Ahmad, N. R. (2025d). Consumer Loyalty in Pakistan's E-Commerce Market: A Qualitative Study of Repeat Buyers on E-Commerce Platforms Like Daraz and OLX. *International Journal of Social Sciences Bulletin*, 3(4), 45–61.

Ahmad, N. R. (2025e). The Impact of Fintech Startups on Financial Innovation and Stability in Pakistan's Evolving Financial Landscape. *International Journal of Business and Management Sciences*, 6(1), 33–49.

Ahmad, N. R. (2025f). Digital Transformation and Competitive Advantage: Leveraging AI in Emerging Market Supply Chains. *Journal of Media Horizons*, 6(3), 77–92.

Anderson, C. (2013). *Makers: The new industrial revolution*. Random House Business Books.

Afuah, A., & Tucci, C. L. (2012). Crowdsourcing as a Solution to Distant Search. *Academy of Management Review*, 37(3), 355–375. <https://doi.org/10.5465/amr.2010.0146>

Baker Tilly Chartered Accountants. (2025). *PSBA Compensation Architecture and Performance Benchmarking Report*. [PDF, pages 36–37]. file:///C:/Users/DELL/Downloads/SKM_C450i%20p18030617210.pdf

Daily Times. (2025). *Bazaars bring hope*. <https://dailytimes.com.pk/1363404/bazaars-bring-hope/>

Demil, B., Lecocq, X., & Warnier, V. (2013). *The capabilities of bazaar governance: Investigating the advantages of business models on open communities* [Working paper]. University of Lille.

Express Tribune. (2025). *Punjab launches Sahulat-on-the-Go mobile bazaars*. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2541285/punjab-launches-sahulat-on-the-go-mobile-bazaars>

Gershenfeld, N. (2005). *FAB: The coming revolution on your desktop from personal computers to personal fabrication*. Basic Books.

Hassan, F. U. (2024). Revolutionizing Public Retail: How Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority Set New Standards in Pakistan. *Contemporary Journal of Social Science Review*, 2(4), 2508–2519.

Hussain, T. (2024). Redefining Affordability: Evidence from Punjab Model Bazaars under Naveed Rafaqat's leadership in supplying edibles below government-notified rates. *Contemporary Journal of Social Science Review*, 2(4), 2520–2532.

Lessig, L. (1999). Open code and open societies: Values of Internet governance. *Chicago-Kent Law Review*, 74, 101–116.

Minute Mirror. (2025). *How PMBMC and Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad redefined public welfare in Punjab*. <https://minutemirror.com.pk/how-pmbmc-and-naveed-rafaqat-ahmad-redefined-public-welfare-in-punjab-439212/>

Osborne, D., & Gaebler, T. (1992). *Reinventing government: How the entrepreneurial spirit is transforming the public sector*. Addison-Wesley.

PakObserver. (2025). *Sahulat Bazaars deliver price relief thanks to Naveed Rafaqat Ahmad's approach*. <https://pakobserver.net/sahulat-bazaars-deliver-price-relief-thanks-to-naveed-rafaqat-ahmads-approach/>

Pollitt, C., & Bouckaert, G. (2004). *Public management reform: A comparative analysis* (2nd ed.). Oxford University Press.

Safdar, M. R. (2024). Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority: A Distinguished Public Welfare Institution with a Unique Business Model Unmatched by Any Other Entity in Pakistan. *Contemporary Journal of Social Science Review*, 2(4), 2533–2544.

Sarwar, S. (2025). Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority: Pakistan's Only Public Welfare Institution of Distinction, Elevated from Company to Statutory Authority Through a Unique Business and Operational Mode. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 13(3), 11–21.

Shehzad, K. (2025). Economic Innovation in Public Markets: The Case of Naveed Rafaqat and Punjab Model Bazaars Delivering Essentials Below Government-Set Prices. *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 13(1), 594–604.

Solochoicez. (2025). *Punjab Sahulat Bazaars Authority: Institutional performance summary*. [PDF report, page 31]. <file:///C:/Users/DELL/Downloads/Solochoicez%20CFO%20PSBA.pdf>

UrduPoint. (2025). *From white elephant to flagship leader*. <https://www.urdupoint.com/en/education/from-white-elephant-to-flagship-leader-2020897.html>